The Effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity

by

Marsie L. Fisk

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF EDUCATION IN EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP

VANCOUVER ISLAND UNIVERSITY

We accept the Process Paper/Thesis/Major Project as conforming to the required standard.

________________________
Peter Skipper, Faculty Supervisor
Faculty of Education,
Vancouver Island University

Date:

________________________
Dr. David Paterson, Dean, Faculty of Education,
Vancouver Island University

Date:

Copyright 2018
Abstract

This purpose of this study was to share the experience of mid-career teachers as they continued to develop and understand their personal and professional identities, and to identify how emotional labor impacts identity. Through an online survey inclusive of closed and open-ended questions, participants provided responses that addressed participant demographics, personal and professional identity, and emotional labour in teaching. These findings provided insight into possible structures that support teachers as they navigate and manage the interdependence of personal and professional identities and emotional labour. This research is important to further understand the role of a teacher as the world evolves around us. As the professional responsibilities of teachers in Alberta change to address societal change, it is important to acknowledge changes in classroom demographics, increased complex needs, and increased support initiatives that contribute to teacher stress and a need for teacher wellness. The outcome of this study was expected to provide insight into structures and processes to support teachers in managing emotional labour.
Acknowledgements

It makes you think differently. That was a common message from colleagues and mentors as I began to think about embarking on the journey of completing a Master’s Degree. They were right, and this process would not have been possible without the support of several people who have taken time out of their own lives to remind me to find balance, trust the process, and to continue to dig deeper. Complete with struggles and rewards, my experience in completing this degree has been a powerful learning journey.

To my parents for their undying support and faith. You have given me the space and time, adjusting your own lives and welcoming me into your home to allow me to actively participate with my cohort or to just be. Regardless of where you physically live, you are home to me. Thank you, love you.

To Marcie for your unfiltered and unquestioned support. You are not only a trusted friend and colleague, but also an example to those of us around you. Your integrity as a person and a leader are second to none. Thank you, love you.

To Cam, although managing your own challenges, your support at home has allowed me to procrastinate when necessary, and to get away when I needed to get to work. I still believe you are one of the most brilliant people I know, and our conversations often caused me to look at things differently. Thank you, love you.

To Randy, a mentor and friend, I quite literally would not be doing this without your confidence and support. I appreciate your faith in me, even when I did not believe in myself.
# Table of Contents

**Abstract** .................................................................................................................................................. 2

**Acknowledgements** ................................................................................................................................. 3

**Table of Contents** .................................................................................................................................... 4

**List of Figures** .......................................................................................................................................... 7

**Chapter 1: Focus and Framing** .................................................................................................................... 8

  * Significance of the Inquiry ......................................................................................................................... 11
  * Purpose of the Study .................................................................................................................................. 13

**Chapter 2: Review of the Literature** ........................................................................................................ 14

  * Identity ..................................................................................................................................................... 14
  * Emotional Labour ..................................................................................................................................... 18
    * Display Rules ........................................................................................................................................ 20
    * Surface Acting ....................................................................................................................................... 20
    * Deep Acting .......................................................................................................................................... 21

**Chapter 3: Methods and Methodology** .................................................................................................... 23

  * Narrative Research ................................................................................................................................. 23
  * Purpose of Study ..................................................................................................................................... 24
  * Method & Ethics ....................................................................................................................................... 24
  * Data Analysis, Findings & Recommendations ......................................................................................... 26

**Chapter Four: Findings and Results** ......................................................................................................... 28
Introduction

Survey Analysis by Question

Survey Demographics

Professional and Personal Identity

Emotional Labour

Professionalism and Professional Ethics

Parent Interactions

Student Behavior

Personal Wellness

Managing the Effects of Emotional Labour

Chapter Five: Summary

Summary and Overview of Research

Conclusions

Personal and Professional Identity

Emotional Labour

Teacher Retention

Structures to Support Managing Emotional Labour

Recommendations for Further Research

References

Appendix A: Survey Questions
Appendix B: Interview Protocol and Session Questions .......................................................... 57
Appendix C: Email Letter of Invitation to Teachers ................................................................. 58
Appendix D: Consent for Participation in Online Survey ........................................................ 59
List of Figures

2.1 Teacher Identity and Emotional Labour ......................................................17
4.1 Years of Teaching Experience ....................................................................27
4.2 Current Roles of Participants .....................................................................28
4.3 Area of Primary Experience of Participants ..............................................28
4.4 Key Terms – Personal Identity Inclusive responses .................................29
4.5 Key Terms – Personal Identity – terms removed .......................................30
4.6 Key Terms – Professional Identity .............................................................31
4.7 Separating Personal and Professional Identity ..........................................32
4.8 Feelings on Emotional Support .................................................................39
4.9 Sources of Emotional Support .................................................................40
4.10 Structures to Support Teachers in Managing Emotional Labour .............41
Chapter 1: Focus and Framing

I remember wanting to quit. It was hard. It was so humiliating. I felt lost. I had taught Math 10 for what seemed like years and I finally had a group of girls that put me to the test. They weren’t bad kids, just chatty, social, typical 15 year olds. It was during a typical lesson - I was at the whiteboard, and they were in their rows. I made what I thought was an innocent comment, trying to refocus the students. Facing the board, back to the students, I said “you know, if you can’t be quiet, maybe outreach is an option?” The lesson continued and I don’t remember there being any fallout – until parent-teacher interviews occurred that night.

I had grown comfortable with parent meetings, having long surpassed the discomfort that new teachers sometimes feel with being alone in a classroom with them. The first interview was with a family I knew casually for several years. I was completely caught off guard when they began, obviously upset, demanding why I would tell their daughter she needed to go to the outreach location. After an hour of an emotional conversation, we came to an understanding of the situation, apologies were made, and we came to an agreement to move forward with their daughter.

The next two interviews went somewhat the same. I was an emotional mess. I felt attacked, broken, and truly questioned my ability to be a teacher. I almost quit that day, but with support from my colleagues, principal, and family, and a lot of soul-searching, I chose to humbly repair the relationships with these students and move forward. I had learned that re-direction should be private, that conversations could be two-way dialogue, really getting to the issues from all perspectives. Working together, we could clarify expectations and how to move forward.

They weren’t bad kids, and I wasn’t a bad teacher. But I felt like one. I took pride in the relationships I had with students. I am a teacher. It’s how I define myself, it’s who I am.
Reflection is a process that uses our stories to open dialogue. As a teacher, personal and professional identity, can be bridged through reflection, connecting a teacher’s core values, beliefs and assumptions with daily practice (Kim & Greene, 2011). Stories are powerful. Whom you are and where you have been affects where you are going. Teachers commonly report that they are challenged by the non-teaching responsibilities they face as a result of significant changes in society and in education, external forces that they have no control over (Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006). Emotional Labour is a phenomenon, defined by Hochschild in 1983, as the ability of an employee to accept and follow the norms or emotional expectations that support an occupation or organization. Although Hochschild’s initial research focused on the service industry and Flight Attendants in particular, the concept of emotional labour as a non-teaching responsibility that has greatly affected the personal and professional identities of teachers, requires further research. Identifying tools to understand the interdependence of personal and professional identities, and their role in teacher wellness might provide insight into how teachers thrive and survive in the teaching profession. O’Connor (2006), clarified that emotions and the natural tendency to care for the human side of teaching requires a focused understanding of how personal identity connects to professional practice. Exploring emotional labour and the interconnections between the personal self and the professional being as it effects teacher wellness, serves to provide teachers with an avenue for growth.

As a formal leader in my school division, I am curious about the connections between personal and professional identity, and resilience. In my experiences as a classroom teacher, school counsellor, inclusive education leader, learning coach, and assistant principal, I have experienced this connection. In my current role as an assistant principal, I have noticed that
there are teachers who have solid reputations with their peers, former students, and the community for being effective and loved. Yet, they no longer seem to be as passionate about teaching and learning as they once were. Inquiring into emotional labour and the strategies teacher use to manage these situations may lead to a better understanding of emotional labour teachers experience, and the interdependence between teachers’ personal and professional identities, and together how this perception impacts teacher practice.

Education in Alberta continues to experience a time of significant change. In 2013, the Alberta Government released the Ministerial Order on Student Learning, placing the best interests of the child at the core of the decision-making process (Government of Alberta, Alberta Education, 2013). The intention of this order was to move the teacher-centered approach to teaching and learning, to a more student-centered approach, requiring a change in mindset for teachers. Compounding the complexity in implementing this shift in practice, the challenges in the Alberta economy have also placed stress on the education system; many families are in a state of flux, communities are becoming more transient, and teachers are dealing with the politics of contract negotiations (Ferguson, 2017). As a result, the leadership needed to move this change forward is increasingly iterating and innovating new strategies to accommodate and appreciate the entire community, including the needs of teachers as they are being asked to shift the manner in which they work.

I am currently in my second year as the assistant principal (AP) at a dual track French Immersion school serving students from kindergarten through grade nine. In addition to my responsibilities as an AP, my teaching assignment is the Inclusive Education Lead (IEL). This allows me the unique opportunity to work alongside teachers in their classrooms, at elbow, in real-time, getting to know them as professionals and as people. Both the IEL and AP roles are
leadership positions; working with teachers on the ground level serves to build relationships founded in trust, mutual respect and a common goal of quality learning. Although there are natural power-over concerns, our shared focus is at the forefront of all that we do.

My relationships within the organization are strong. The connections I have made professionally and personally through working at four different sites within this school division, are founded in trust and shared values, putting students and learning at the center of our work. I have the advantage of knowing the system and participate in several of the sub-cultures as a high school teacher, inclusive education lead, learning coach, student leadership advisor and athletics coach. It is through this work that I have observed that there is a need for further research in the areas of emotional labour and teacher identity.

**Significance of the Inquiry**

At the local level, our school division has also experienced much change in the recent years. The changes include a new Quality Learning Framework, assessment model, and reporting process with a revised report card. A new Learning Supports (LS) structure is also being introduced to provide site-based support as we continue to move to a more collaborative and inclusive culture of learning. Practices that were once supported and encouraged are being replaced by newly identified practices and innovative pedagogies. At the end of the 2016-2017 school year, our administration team gathered perspectives from teachers on how they were feeling about the work that had been done, and implemented the changes as decided. It seemed that the changes in classroom demographics, increased complex needs, and too many initiatives were factors which added to teacher stress and a concern for teacher wellness. There are mixed emotions surrounding balancing the needs of the students and teacher wellness, this contributed to the stress and uncertainty of many mid-career teachers. It is my supposition that in the midst
of such change that teachers are experiencing the effects of emotional labour. Consequently, members of the profession have struggled with separating personal and professional identity. As in other professions, teachers have been searching for tools and supports to assist them in continuing to effectively accomplish their duty; to provide quality learning opportunities.

The concept of emotional labour (EL) is relatively new in educational research. Introduced in 1983 by Hochschild, and further studied by Diefendorff, 2005, Grandey, 2003, O'Connor K., 2006, Totterdell & Holman, 2003, Zapf, 2002, Zembylas, 2005. Emotional labour is defined as emotional regulation of employees as they complete occupational or organizational duties within the norms established (p. 9). Emotional regulation (ER) has also become a popular topic in the area of psychology in the past two decades. ER has been defined by “the measures taken by an individual to modify the natural courses of an affective response (Whitely & Berking, 2014, p. 5).” Understanding the connection between ER and EL will allow us to further understand the effect off EL on teacher identity. There is much research in the areas of identity surrounding beginning teachers and retention (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009; Goddard & Foster, 2001). However, there appears to be a gap in assessing the connection between emotional labour and teacher identity, in mid-career teachers. As the education system continues to evolve in response to societal change, it is important to look into these areas for not only beginning teachers, but experienced and mid-career teachers as well to address the gap in research. The lived experiences of mid-career teachers may be different than those of new teachers, contributing differently to personal and professional identity.
Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study is to give a voice to mid-career teachers and the effects of emotional labour on the interdependence between personal and professional identity; as well as to discover any supports that may be used to support teacher wellness in managing these effects.

This inquiry will address the following question: What are the effects of emotional labour on personal and professional identity?

Sub questions for this inquiry are:

1. How do emotions affect teacher practice on a daily basis?
2. How do teachers differentiate personal and professional identity?
3. How might emotional labour affect teacher retention?
4. What processes or structures could be implemented to support teachers in managing the effects of emotional labour?
Chapter 2: Review of the Literature

As individuals continue to grow and learn, understanding the self and how identity intertwines with professional roles has been studied in many fields. Research has delved into broad topics such as social identity theory and identity theory which encompass many facets. Specifically, in looking at the personal and professional identities of teachers, it is important to look at the interdependence of how teachers might see themselves as individuals and as members of a specific group; to understand the impact of the roles within the system and how the social categories are connected (Stets & Burke, 2000). Understanding the connection between personal and professional identity through the role of a teacher includes understanding the emotional labour that is required in order to meet the expectations of this role.

Identity

I’m pretty sure there was never another option, I was always going to be a teacher. My dad was a teacher, with 35 years of service before retiring in 1994. My grandma was a teacher, having taught in one room schoolhouses throughout the prairies, starting in 1921. My aunt too, spent her whole career in a classroom. Two cousins, a brother and me, we all followed in their footsteps. There was never another option. We were teachers, it was in our blood.

Identity has become an area of interest in educational research. Described as a dynamic process that is “a constantly evolving phenomenon” (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009), the concept of identity can further be understood through the social identity theory and identity theory. There is great value in understanding the effect that social groups have in the educational context. The Social Identity Theory research has developed a well-established framework to support these theoretical foundations (Abrams & Hogg, 2008; Hogg & Terry, 2000). Perhaps the essential idea of Social Identity Theory is that it states the value of belonging to a group as
fundamental to the interpersonal-intergroup spectrum. Social identity allows for group behaviors to be grounded together. In order for this to occur, there is a need for understanding of the main tenets of Social Identity Theory; including social identities, group performance, and self-categorization.

Social identities are comprised of three main concepts, social identity salience, nested identities and cross-cutting identities. Social identity salience stems from the original research in identity theory. In the social identity research, this focuses on the salience of social identities as opposed to individual identities. Group contexts dictates this saliency. The individuals of a group present the social identity which is most representative of their understanding of the social setting (Burford, 2012). Teachers are also mothers, fathers, daughters and sons, coaches, leaders, and team members; in one setting they might be the leader, in another an active participant. The social behavior options will differ as the roles differ. This flexibility describes social identity salience and is viewed as impactful in affecting identification and performance in a social or group context (Haslam, 2003).

Nested identities and cross-cutting identities are present in system structures, formal leadership roles and specific assignments that are “attached to formal social categories” (Hogg & Terry, 2000). Nested identities might also be described as sub-cultures, described by Hogg and Terry as higher-order identities and lower-order identities. Higher-order identities can be represented by big-picture groups such as local school divisions; lower-order groups will relate to the more specific staff involved in the Wellness Initiative as Health Champions. Both identities have a great impact on social identity and are crucial to understanding the system social categories. Hogg & Terry (2000) also describe cross-cutting identities as those that ‘can be either formal or informal’. Staff involved in the Wellness Initiative might then also see this
role as a cross-cutting identity in a minor formal role, where a more informal role would speak to friendship groups or chosen alliances. The salience of these groups is dependent on the level of personal relevance and specific importance, allowing an individual’s identity to flex.

Applications of Social Identity Theory to the educational context are important in further understanding the professional identities of teachers. Although there has been little focused research into the social identity of teachers and the connection to their professional identity, there is potential in aligning Social Identity Theory tenets in order to inform the expectations and roles of teachers in their work. Teachers have a challenging job in educating all children and the diversity that this includes; social identity theory may share a language which will validate the interdependence of personal and professional identities of teachers.

As with other professionals, for teachers, identity consists of the view of self, and the view of self in the professional context; both interpersonal and as an intergroup phenomenon. Other disciplines such as the social sciences, including philosophy, psychology, sociology, and psychotherapy all contribute to the definitions of self or identity using slightly different lenses (Kim & Greene, 2011; Hendry, 2009). As these terms are often used synonymously, the literature in teacher education seeks to understand the interconnectedness of personal and professional identity that ebbs and flows through tensions and successes in their work (Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006). The lived experiences of teachers influenced personal identity through self-awareness and the opinions of others as identified by the teacher (Palmer, 1998). Palmer (1998) also asserted that “identity and integrity have as much to do with our shadows and limits, our wounds and fears, as with our strengths and potentials” (Palmer, 1998, p. 13). As more research is done in the area of teacher identity, it will be important to include the experiences and voice of the mid-career teacher.
The professional identity of teachers has been thoroughly discussed as a complex research topic; an evolution consisting of self-image, self-esteem, motivation, task perception and future perspective (Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006). It is therefore difficult to separate the professional from the personal. Professional identity is not only defined by the opinions and expectations of other people, but is influenced by the accepted perception in society about what a teacher should know and do (Goddard & Foster, 2000). This includes what teachers as individuals find important in their professional work and lives based on both their lived experiences in practice and their personal lives (Tickle, 2000).

Teachers’ beliefs, attitudes, and actions are fundamental in defining teacher identity. The personal and professional are “intimately linked” to professional roles (Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006, p. 603). This implies that the roles of the teacher have an effect on identity, however the terms are not interchangeable. It is important to remember that “teaching takes place at the intersection of personal and public life” (Tateo, 2012). The point of intersection, teaching, requires elements of the personal and the professional (public) identity, creating a synergy of the two.

The factors that influence teachers in their personal lives has been well documented in recent years (Day, Kington, Stobart, & Sammons, 2006; Goddard & Foster, 2001; Tait, 2008). One of these factors that is relatively new in the area of educational research is emotional labour (EL). Although teaching is based in relationships which involve emotions, the concept of emotional labour is not often included in the role description of a teacher. The role of a teacher is not simply the dissemination of information, but the development and sustainment of a quality learning environment. The effective practice of a teacher includes enthusiastically presenting concepts with dynamic and innovative techniques, responding to the emotions of students with
empathy and care, all the while putting their own personal emotions in the background. The social conditions that surround teachers personal and professional lives combined with their values, beliefs, and lived experiences make up a teacher’s identity (Gu & Day, 2006). In The Courage to Teach: Exploring the Inner Landscape of a Teacher’s Life (1998), Palmer suggested that intellectual, emotional, and spiritual self must be combined in order to see the interdependence of personal and professional identities. He affirmed that good teaching is based in integrity and personal identity. It is necessary to further understand the concept of emotional labour as a key component of teacher identity in order to continue to support teachers in delivering quality learning opportunities.

**Emotional Labour**

Emotions have been a topic of research consistently throughout the last few decades, primarily in the fields of psychology and sociology. In organizational behavior literature, research has focused on the role of emotion in the workplace. Emotional Labour is a concept defined by Hochschild in 1983 as an employee’s ability to adhere to the norms or emotional expectations applied within an occupation or organization. Hochschild also tells us that emotional labour requires behaving in a certain way which aligns with what is expected by others of a given task or role. Although Hochschild’s initial work studied the emotional work or emotional labour with flight attendants, other professions which include the need for human interactions, the service industries, policing, health care, and education, have begun to research the effects of emotion on employee’s work. Much of the current research on Emotional Labour states that systems declare standards of acceptable emotional expression which constitute specific display rules (Grandey A. A., 2003; Hochschild A., 1979). Studies on emotional labour
in classrooms have shown that teachers will sometimes avoid showing certain emotions as well as display others as they assume it is expected within the education context (Zembylas, 2005).

As previously stated, emotional labour is a phenomenon that involves the expected ways that a person will display their emotional responses to given situation. In the school or classroom, this might range from the happiness of being greeted with hugs and smiles, to the frustrations of dealing with the challenges of a student with mental health issues. Assessment of these situations involves opinions and judgements, and ultimately emotions (Pekrun, Frenzel, Goetz, & Pekrun, 2007). Emotional labour therefore requires that teachers sometimes choose to present themselves in a way that withholds or masks their true emotions. Hochschild (2012) describes these parameters as display rules, and suggests that caregivers demonstrate surface acting and deep acting, in order to do the work of a teacher. It follows that the energy teachers put into not only accomplishing the tasks included in the role of teacher, but also into managing their emotions in response to the daily interactions with students, colleagues, and parents can be extensive. The need to express, suppress, and even generate expected emotions in response to the assumed need of the students and situation occurs throughout the day of a teacher.

Figure 2.1 – Teacher Identity and Emotional Labour
Display Rules

The rules or norms, which frame the manner in which people interact are the standards of behavior dictated by society as a whole. In her initial work, Hochschild (1979, 2012) defines these standards as feeling rules; the structures by which we manage our inner feelings. Diefendorff and Gosserand (2003), narrowed this definition to the process of achieving work goals through regulation of emotional displays. The emotional display that results becomes a facilitator in accomplishing successive work goals.

Although teacher education teaching does not directly include an introduction to display rules, through our professional codes of conduct, the ethic of care has been embedded in many vision and mission statements. According to Diefendorff and Gosserand (2003), the process of emotional labor involves the constant comparison of personal emotional displays with system display rules, to confirm that the displays are appropriate to the environment. If there is a discrepancy between displays and display rules, the use emotion regulation strategies is necessary to ensure that future emotional displays align with display rules. Much like those that work in the service industry, teachers are expected to present themselves in interactions with students, colleagues, and parents with positive emotions such as joy, excitement, and enthusiasm rather than negative emotions such as anger, disgust, or irritation. Display rules, although not explicit in administrative policies, are present in the expectations of society and the profession (Zapf, 2002).

Surface Acting

The internal conflict that a teacher must manage in order to display certain emotions while censoring others has the potential to be present in all interactions. One of the two commonly used strategies that are used to regulate emotional displays in the workplace is surface acting. The act of internally responding to a situation emotionally in one manner, while
presenting a different emotion is referred to as surface acting by Hochschild (1979). Surface acting is a means of emotional regulation that occurs as a response to a situation when the emotion has already been stimulated. This manifests as managing emotional expressions, rather than adjusting internal feelings. (Grandey A. A., 2003; Totterdell & Holman, 2003). As teachers continue to put the needs of the student ahead of their own, they may mask their true feelings and present an appropriate response as though it were genuine. A teacher might demonstrate happiness with a smiley face, or through appropriate proximity, although feeling overwhelmed, frustrated, or angry. Surface acting allows a teacher to meet the expectations of a professional role in the school setting, although there is a possibility of appearing fake or inauthentic. Due to the reality of not the projected emotion and the emotion actually felt, surface acting can require a great deal of effort, often leading to deeper feelings of emotional dysregulation.

**Deep Acting**

In contrast, to surface acting, Hochschild (1979) refers to deep acting as the attempt to truly feel the expected emotion, regulating a natural response with effort; knowing the emotion a person wants to feel, and using strategies to actually align the felt emotion with the emotion presented (Grandey, 2003). There is effort required to manage emotions; deliberately reminding themselves of or inciting memories, thoughts, or imagery to bring about an emotion. The practice and policies surrounding inclusive education might provide teachers with the foundation to demonstrate an infallible commitment to education for all although feeling ill prepared and un-skilled in working with diverse learning needs. Despite the source that might affect a teacher’s natural tendency to demonstrate care and compassion towards their students, deep acting supports the practice of school based display rules while allowing the teacher to manage internal feelings in order to align with the demonstrated external expression.
The understanding of emotional labour and social identity theory is directly connected to the interdependence of teachers’ emotional practice and teacher identity. As Zembylas (2005) argued, emotion and identity are simultaneously social and individual. Identity evolves and changes through dialogues and practice of emotion. The research on identity and emotions have evolved separately and there are conceptual differences regarding what constitutes teacher identity. Whereas most literature regards teacher identity as always evolving, it is typically compared with what is described as teachers’ professional roles. Professional roles may be assigned to teachers or described by them, but professional identities emerge through their emotions and values (O'Connor K., 2008). As such, teacher identity and professional roles are intertwined in that identity as a teacher experiences emotions that are connected with or disconnected from the expected professional roles. The interdependence of professional roles and identity is further discussed by Flores and Day (2006). They found the construction and reconstruction of identity to be dependent on personal lived experiences, teacher education, and school culture. Teacher identity is ever-changing, based on the gaps in understanding between the expected experiences and the lived experiences, knowing that the context of teaching greatly impacts these changes.
Chapter 3: Methods and Methodology

For the purpose of this study, I chose to use a mixed methods approach including a survey to address general teacher perception on teachers’ personal and professional identities and the impact of emotional labour. I also wanted to share the stories of real teachers as they navigate the fine line between personal and professional identities while examining why this might or might not be a valid challenge. It was my hope that in further examining teacher identity and emotional labour that structures and supports would be identified to strengthen teacher wellness.

Narrative Research

As qualitative research becomes more the norm in the discipline of education, it is important to choose carefully an appropriate methodological approach. Narrative research involves the process of telling stories, encouraging inquiry into the experiences of the researcher in addition to study participants (Hendry, 2009). As a reflective person, I know that telling my story and engaging in ongoing reflection will be genuine and demonstrate a willingness to be vulnerable and to grow my understanding of the reflective process. Narrative research is a process which encourages meaning making that includes three main underpinnings of inquiry, “the scientific (physical), the symbolic (human experience), and the sacred (metaphysical)” (p. 72). The power in narrative research is in asking questions that lead to well thought out responses. Through analysis, inquiry questions comprise personal narratives that share a person’s viewpoint – their story.

The voice given to the responses in a narrative inquiry allows teachers and researchers to delve into personal experience as well as the experiences of others. Narrative research is a structure that uses questions to understand the world; it is a powerful method that is used to “remind us of the complex and multiple ways in which humans make meaning” (Hendry, 2009,
The process also allows for reiterating the inquiry questions in order to check personal assumptions, mental models, and the base of knowledge as needed. The use of stories as narratives as a methodology creates authentic opportunities for human experience to be examined through questions.

**Purpose of Study**

This goal of this study is multi-purposed. First, to identify if emotional labour does effect teacher identity. Second, to share the experience of mid-career teachers as they discuss the impact that emotional labour might have on the continued development and understanding of their personal and professional identities. Third, to identify possible supports for teachers to contribute to personal wellness in managing this impact. My hope for this narrative study as a new assistant principal, was to explore and examine the interconnection between emotional labour and personal and professional identity; and to identify any supports for mid-career teachers. Teachers connect to their students, building trusting, supportive relationships. I believe that administrators have the same obligation to their teachers.

**Method & Ethics**

The study sought mid-career teacher participants to examine through individual reflection, how personal and professional identities interconnect and the effect that emotional labour had in this interplay. Using stories to explore the perspective of teachers on identity, resilience, and reflection gave a voice to the teachers, making them active participants in the research.

As an assistant principal, it was important to frame an ethical proposal. Participation was voluntary and consents were required. Data was gathered through an online questionnaire. A Google Form gathered the responses ensuring anonymity by not requesting email confirmation.
To address the power over concerns, participants were sought from sites and districts other than my own. It was made clear through survey invitations and questionnaires that the opportunity to withdraw was not possible once a questionnaire had been submitted, however the questionnaire was anonymous and identifying the participant was not be possible through the GSuite platform. At no time have any specific comments be attributed to any individual. All received data was kept confidential in a locked cupboard or on a password protected personal device. Participants were reminded not to provide any identifying information such as names, school name, or names of programs that are unique to a school. Since GSuite servers are located in the United States, participants were advised that its governments, courts, or law enforcement and regulatory agencies may be able to obtain disclosure of the data through the laws of the United States. Protecting the welfare of teacher participants is an important step in the research process.

Participants had the option of participating in individual interviews once the data has been initially analyzed. The purpose of the voluntary interviews was to have teacher participation in confirming and discussing the themes and concepts that emerged from the survey. The interviews would have allowed all participants the opportunity to share deeper should they choose.

The Initial expectation for responses to the online survey was approximately ten percent of my personal online connections. This was estimated at forty participants. Although the survey invitation was originally expected to be posted for a duration of two weeks, after only six days, there were over one hundred and fifty responses. At that point, along with my supervisor, it was decided that the survey would be closed and a statement explaining my appreciation for interest in participation would be posted to explain the early closure of data gathering. The final number of respondents was one hundred and fifty-five. There was only one response to the
invitation for a personal invitation and I realized that person was a teacher in my division and would not fit the criteria for the personal interview in accordance with ethics approval. In order to put a voice to the data, I decided to incorporate my personal scholarship of practice reflections in order to connect with the practice of scholarship presented through the survey results.

**Data Analysis, Findings & Recommendations**

The qualitative and quantitative data gathered through the online survey and throughout my personal reflections has been compiled, analyzed, and sorted for themes. I initially began with six priori and added eight emergent codes. After I identified the most frequently occurring and recurring themes, I reviewed my personal researcher’s journal for reflections that supported or were in contradiction to the supporting themes. Personal reflections and stories have been used as evidence to support these themes.

**Validity & Trustworthiness**

Validity of this study was emphasized through the quantity and diversity of the population sample including ‘beginning’ through ‘end of career’ teachers primarily in Alberta through the online survey. Although the purpose of this study was to investigate more specifically the views and voice of mid-career teachers, a broader invitation was used to validate the scope of the effect of emotional labour. Although I was surprised by the number of responses, I was impressed with the candor and openness of the respondents. I was able to further understand the experiences of a diverse group of teachers through the survey data. The volume of respondents speaks to the importance of emotions on teacher identity and the need for further research. I did find at times that this work was challenging as I explored the content of the survey responses and compared this with my personal experiences as a teacher and an assistant principal.
People and purpose are at the core of my work, informing my personal approach to educational leadership. I chose to pursue this topic to look closely at the effects of emotional labour on personal and professional identity to determine if my experiences were the exception, or the norm. Teachers were given the opportunity to share their voice and the hope was that they would further understand the concept of emotional labour as well as have clarified their own personal and professional identities.
Chapter Four: Findings and Results

Introduction

This chapter discusses data analysis findings to address the primary and sub questions of the study: What are the effects of emotional labour on personal and professional identity? i) How do teachers describe personal and professional identity? ii) How do emotions affect teacher practice on a daily basis? iii) What are the connections between identity and emotional labour? iv) What processes or structures could be implemented to support teachers in managing the effects of emotional labour? The results of this study were gathered through a survey conducted by the researcher during the 2017-2018 school year with respondents to an online invitation.

Initial interpretations of the data will be shared to include study results. To bring a voice to the data, excerpts from my personal researcher’s journal have been blended in with the data. This allows readers to understand the experience of a teacher and leader with a transparent approach to the research.

Survey Analysis by Question

The first four questions of the survey gathered demographic information to further understand the sample. The remaining questions consisted of eight open-ended questions and six closed-ended questions inquiring into the respondents’ views on teacher identity, emotional labour, and possible supports for teachers. Demographic information was collected to identify correlations, if any, between certain groups of teachers and their perception of identity, emotional labour, and possible supports. The correlations found will be discussed in Chapter five through the summary of findings.
Survey Demographics

One hundred and fifty-five responses were gathered through an online survey platform. The main sample target of this survey is mid-career teachers; for the purpose of this study teachers with zero through five and greater than twenty-five years of experience have not been included. For that reason, twenty-eight responses were removed from the data with an active sample of 127 responses being used. The range of teaching experience being discussed is six through 25 years. The respondents have indicated the role that they have primarily held during this time was as classroom teacher, district staff, school-based leaders, teacher leaders, and counsellors, with the bulk of respondents being classroom teachers.

*Figure 4.1: Years of Teaching Experience*
Figure 4.2: Current Roles of Participants

Figure 4.3: Area of Primary Experience of Participants
Professional and Personal Identity

In order to explore the relationship between personal and professional identity, respondents were asked to describe their personal identity and their professional identity using key words. The format of the survey might have affected the first opened question to define personal identity. Many responses included the terms pedagogical expert, didactical expert, and subject matter expert, as these terms were defined in the survey set up. Other key terms predominantly shared were teacher, expert, mother, caring, compassionate, and strong.

![Word Cloud: Key Term - Personal Identity Inclusive responses](image)

After removing these terms, there are clear themes that are identified. Teachers described their personal identity as teachers, in terms of their relationships, and as caregivers including terms such as teacher, mother, expert, wife, comapssionate, strong. When asked to describe my own personal identity, I would use words such as caring, committed, focused, loving, and, loyal;
a daughter, sister, friend, and teacher. Although being a teacher is a huge part of who I am, it does not define me, rather who I am as a person is what defines who I am as a teacher.

![Figure 4.5: Key Term - Personal Identity – terms removed]

Teachers were asked to describe their professional identity by selecting any or all from the terms provided; subject matter expert, didactical expert, and pedagogical expert. The survey results showed 45.7% of participants identified subject matter expert as a component of their identity, 33.8% identified didactical expert, and 81.5% identify as pedagogical experts. Participants were able to choose more than one option which accounts for the total being greater than 100%.

Professionally, I am a leader who puts the needs of the students and my teachers before my own. Regardless of my title or role, I am a teacher first. As my roles and assignments have changed, so has my professional identity. At one point, I would have defined myself as a subject matter specialist. Through professional learning and professional experience, this definition would grow to become a didactical expert, and through increased understanding a pedagogical expert.
Question # 3 asked if teachers are able to separate their personal and professional identities, 57% said no. 30% said yes. The remaining 13% provided a common qualifying statement that spoke to ‘sometimes’ if a teacher is able to compartmentalize. Responses also spoke to the need for purposeful separation, the size and location of a community, and the teachers’ position in society.

As I reflected upon the interconnectedness of personal and professional identities, I found myself coming back my personal mantra with each question analysis; *I am a teacher, it’s who I am.* Personally, I find it extremely difficult to separate my personal and professional identities. Although contructive feedback is necessary to learn and grow, when feeling as though my professionalism is questioned, I equate that with having my personal integrity questioned. It may not be accurate, but it is a reality. I am a teacher, it’s who I am.

Personal and professional identities are undoubtedly interconnected. As teachers, we teach from who we are and where we have been. Personal values, beliefs, and actions evolve.
and flex as the components of one’s identity grow and change, influencing one’s professional identity as well.

![Can Teachers Separate Personal and Professional Identities](image)

**Figure 4.7: Separating Personal and Professional Identity**

To understand if there was a correlation between identity and initial motivation for choosing to become a teacher, respondents were asked to identify the main reasons why they chose to enter the profession. Dominant themes presenting from this question are a love for children and youth, to contribute and make a difference in an inclusive manner, a love of learning and desire to share that passion, and previous experiences with teachers and school. One teacher stated that “teaching allows me to share knowledge and experiences that I’m passionate about while building relationships with our future leaders.” For 79.7% of participants, these reasons were still valid during the completion of the survey. Of the remaining 20.3%, 4.6% stated that these reasons were no longer valid, while 16.3% reported that sometimes they were still valid.
In my reflections of my personal identity and initial motivation to teach, passion and purpose have always been at the core of who I am. As a teacher, my passion has been learning, and my purpose has been to do what is best for kids. I have always wanted to be teacher. My grandmother taught in one room schools from the 1920s through 1970s. My father taught for thirty-two years. My brother, one aunt, 4 cousins; we all chose to be teachers. It’s in our blood, was there any other choice?

*If I could have gone and pumped gas for a living I would have. But they don’t do that anymore, self-serve everywhere! What else can I do with an education degree? You’re educated they said, you have skills. But what skills exactly? Sure, I am a compassionate, caring person. I love math, and coaching, and life in a high school. But really, I’m tired, my heart hurts. What else can I do? I’ve never wanted anything else. I am a teacher, it’s who I am.*

Participants were asked if they had ever considered leaving the profession in question #5. An overwhelming 74.2% of respondents identified that they had considered leaving the profession, while 25.8% identified that they had not considered leaving the profession. Although there were many reasons shared to support why participants had considered leaving the profession, there were also reasons to support those who had not considered leaving the profession. Participants who had considered leaving the profession cited increased workload and demands, lack of appreciation, stress resulting from increased needs in the classroom, assessment expectations, and a lack of parental support. Those participants who had not considered leaving the profession cited a love for teaching and making a difference in lives of children. Although the majority of responses show a staggering frustration with the expectations of the role of a teacher, there is a strong connection between the motivation to choose teaching as a profession and the rationale for not wanting to leave the profession as well.
There were a lot of days I left the school with a smile on my face; there have been a lot of days where I have left wondering if I could keep coming back. What else could I do with an Education Degree? I was exhausted, overwhelmed with feelings of inadequacy. Why was there never ‘enough’? Enough time to get everything done, enough resources to meet the needs of the students, enough communication with parents, enough appreciation from administration and parents. It was the good days, the ones that you had to force yourself to remember. Going back to the ‘why’. Why do I do this? Passion and purpose. Learning and doing what is best for kids.

**Emotional Labour**

*Ok, I’ve got this. Math 9 and CALM 20. At the same time. Two different classrooms.*

*Hmmm, yep I’ve got this. I need to get the contract, show them what I’ve got. For the first forty minutes, instruct gr. 9, Calm students can do independent work. Keep the doors open. Pop in and out. It’s good, I’ve got this. I’m a teacher, it’s what I do.*

Participants were asked to describe a situation where they had acted differently that they felt to meet the perceived expectations of a teacher; the responses are diverse and subjective. However, through a detailed analysis and coding process, four dominant themes were identified. Participants shared opinions and examples that have been classified as professionalism and professional ethics, conflicts and lack of support from parents, increased behavior challenges with students, and personal challenges. Teaching is hard; and it is amazing at the same time. Putting on a face to meet the requirements of a professional interaction in a role that is based on relationships can be overwhelming and exhausting. The system requires a level of professionalism regardless of the situation. Interacting with students, parents, colleagues, and the general community puts teachers in many difficult situations where they must navigate back and forth between their personal beliefs and values and those of the system.
Professionalism and Professional Ethics

How could this be happening? As teachers, they encouraged students to stage a petition against the administration. And for what? To have first crack at option selections. We’ve worked so hard to build a culture of trust based on solid relationships; a culture where integrity is at the core of all we do. I was angry, I was sad. What had gone wrong?

From the data, participant responses which speak to professionalism and professional ethics shared a staggering challenge of collegial interaction. Adhering to Codes of Conduct was mentioned by 25.2% of those participants who offered a response to the open-ended prompt. Several responses spoke to having to “hold my tongue” in regards to interactions with colleagues, parents, and students. Fear of retribution from peers outweighed fear of judgment from administration. Responses also shared a frustration with having to explain absences due to personal needs although it is a right as per collective agreements. There is an underlying theme which clearly shows a need to “follow the code.” Teacher Codes of Conduct are structures which provide a framework for professionalism and professional ethics. Although guiding the interactions of teachers with colleagues is only one component of such codes, it can be viewed as restrictive. However, professional organizations provide access to supports which can mediate and guide teachers as they navigate these challenging experiences. Understanding the Code of Conduct, its processes and procedures, provides teachers with support and direction.

Parent Interactions

As he sat across from me with his son on his lap, spewing accusations of neglect and abuse, my blood began to boil. How dare he! Every day, I check in on his boys, hugging them, letting them know that they are loved here, and protected. I tried, really I did to keep my cool, to remain professional as I asked his son to wait in the front office. Once the door closed, I found
my voice and emphatically stated that he had no right to talk to me like that; that his boys along with 730 other children were safe and cared for when under our watch. Being told I was taking it personally, I responded with ‘Of Course I am’. I am teacher; it’s who I am.

Interactions with parents are “carefully considered to ensure that professionalism” is presented in all situations. This dominant theme is mentioned in regards to written communication, parent meetings, and in response to family dynamics and students in crisis. Participants shared examples of being personally and professional attacked by parents in response to communication about student behavior. Responses also shared an overwhelming practice of choosing to remain professional rather than being assertive in interactions with parents. Relationships are a key component of teaching. As society has changed, so has the structure of relationships between parents and teachers. Although with technology, access and communication should be more available, face-to-face interactions have become less and less. It is difficult to develop positive relationships with parents when the school is no longer the hub of a community as it once was. Accordingly, difficult conversations become more difficult when relationships are lacking.

**Student Behavior**

*What is the function of the behavior? That was always my first thought after an incident; even after being chased by a student wielding a 2 x 4, even after being struck and injured by a 14-year-old boy. How could we have prevented this? What could we have done differently? It is later in my home, when I shake my head in wonder. Wonder at why am I looking for fault in our staff, in myself? I didn’t cause this, we didn’t cause this, but we are teachers, it’s who we are.*

Increased student behavior that is physical and extreme in nature proved to be a dominant theme as well as shared by 20.1% of comments provided. Classroom dynamics and a lack of
parent support in an effort to provide inclusive environments are stated as a rationale for increased behaviors which put teachers and staff at risk of being physically assaulted. Teachers also shared that they “manage behaviors and issues that are well beyond education and knowledge.”

**Personal Wellness**

_It was good intentions that I bought the elliptical trainer; with good intentions that I set up the gym in the basement; that I pre-booked massages every month. But there was so much work to do, 10 hour days wasn’t enough. Returning home exhausted from putting other people’s children first, it was easy to put myself on the back burner. Poor eating, disrupted sleep, and a lack of physical activity led to a depressive episode that consumed me outside of school. At school, the mask went on, get in, do the work, get out. At home I could fall apart._

Through the responses shared, there appears to be a fourth dominant theme that addresses the personal needs of teachers. Placing professional expectations ahead of the needs of themselves personally was shared by 20.1% of the respondents. Teachers felt that in order to meet the perceived expectations of a teacher, they needed to suppress emotions that were related to their personal lives. “All during my husband’s cancer treatment, our loss of him and subsequent loss of my boyfriend to heart failure after that, I powered through emotion, anxiety, and depression to be able to do my job.” When dealing with sensitive issues in the school and community, teachers felt that they “have to keep (their) own beliefs in check.”

When asked to describe a situation where personal emotions affected professional duties as a teacher, similar themes were identified in comparison to the previous question when describing how a teacher might act differently that they feel in order to meet the expectations of a teacher. These dominant themes deal with student behavior and compassion for students, being
emotionally connected to professional responsibilities, personal mental health, and family expectations and needs.

Changing dynamics in the classroom, and increased instances of extreme behavior by students have affected professional duties and personal emotions of teachers. One participant shared that there was “not one time, but many. When a student lashes out and I am over tired or dealing with stress in my life etc., it’s difficult not to take it personally and react.” Teachers shared in 26.8% of responses that student behavior and compassion for students effect their personal emotions.

Teachers also shared that they professional responsibilities and expectations of their role effect their personal emotions. In 21.6% of responses, teachers spoke to increased workload, a feeling of inadequacy and lack of confidence, being unable to trust colleagues. “My confidence was shot. I doubted my choices and my capabilities. It’s followed me for years. That effects how I deal with colleagues, admin and parents to this day. My true talents and strengths don’t come out as naturally anymore.”

Managing the effects of personal mental health and family responsibilities is present in 40.2% of responses. Participants spoke to dealing with grief and loss, changing family dynamics, depression and exhaustion, as well as being overwhelmed by the demands of family and personal commitments. One participant shared that “I felt that the job was more important than my health.” Another respondent spoke to “shutting off my personal life when entering the school doors.” The personal lives of teachers effect professional duties in many ways.

Participants shared frustrations with the system that have been shared in other recent studies. Duxbury and Higgins completed a study for the Alberta Teachers Association (ATA) on work-life balance with a sample of 2,500 Alberta teachers. They found that teachers work
significantly more hours per week than most Canadians, and that the “workload and work-life issues may be having a negative impact on the well-being of a substantive portion of teachers in Alberta” (Duxbury & Higgins, 2013).

**Managing the Effects of Emotional Labour**

*I couldn’t do it any longer. But then I was doing it. Again and again. I managed the situation; be it student-teacher, student-student, teacher-teacher, teacher-parent. Tell me more, I’d ask. What was the problem? We needed to solve the problem. I had my own supports in my administration team, and in my family and friends at home. It is hard to be purposeful in compartmentalizing emotional work but it was necessary in order to stay sane.*

Teacher participants were asked to identify if they felt emotionally supported in their roles. Of the 127 responses, 66 said they felt supported, while 61 said that they did not.

![Pie chart showing feelings on emotional support](image)

**Figure 4.8: Feelings on Emotional Support**

Those who felt supported shared that they felt supported primarily by colleagues, school and district level support teams, as well as friends and family.
To provide teachers with a voice, participants were asked to identify processes or structures that could be implemented or changed to better support teachers in managing the effects of emotional labour. Although there were many specific suggestions shared, these were dominant categories. The three greatest categories are mental health supports for all staff, increased relational trust, self-care and wellness. Additional supports suggested are contractual supports, a focus on culture, time to debrief and share, increased supports for inclusive practices, and time for professional learning to address changing expectations, inclusion, collaboration, and wellness. Teachers as educated people know what they need in order to balance their emotional wellness with their professional responsibilities. Finding time and space to take the steps to ensure that supports are accessed can prove to be challenging. If given a voice in a trusting environment, teachers will work alongside school and system leaders to implement supports for all.

Figure 4.9: Sources of Emotional Support
Figure 4.10: Structures to Support Teachers in Managing Emotional Labour

Mental Health Supports for students and staff are not only relevant but valued by the majority of teachers. A proposed solution is to provide timely access to system level supports for teachers and students. When the system embeds mental health support within the district and schools, all stakeholders would see this as a priority.

Culture in any system is key to a successful environment. Relational trust supports culture in a school, “a culture of trust when teachers feel that they can share, talk about their burden. The structure can be great, it has to intertwine with trust.” School administrators and teacher leaders have an obligation to work with teachers and the school community to build trust through transparent, collaborative working relationships.

Teachers as educated people know that self-care is important in being effective in the classroom. There is however an overwhelming feeling of exhaustion that comes from putting the
requirements of the job ahead of personal health. “I think that if I would have started mindful practice or meditation earlier I would have been able to better handle my emotions over the course of my career.” Teachers would benefit from easier access to supports such as Health Spending Accounts and wellness programs. Contractual supports for wellness days, health spending accounts, collaboration time, and the freedom to access these supports without fear of judgement would support teacher wellness.

The dynamics within the classroom setting are vast. The pressure on teachers to meet the needs of all students within an inclusive classroom requires many supports. Teachers will manage these needs more readily when provided with appropriate classroom supports. Although one desired support is “having Educational Assistants in all classrooms”, this is not always financially feasible. Providing teachers with professional learning opportunities, inclusive classroom tools, and appropriate curricular resources can also be a support to address teacher wellness.
Chapter Five: Summary

This final chapter is the summary of the research done, and suggests conclusions made through the process of this study. Recommendations to address the effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity follow, clarifying areas for possible further research.

Summary and Overview of Research

This study endeavored to identify the effects, if any, that emotional labour might have on the personal and professional identities of mid-career teachers. Through closed and open-ended questions, participants provided responses which addressed participant demographics, personal and professional identity, and emotional labour in teaching. These findings may provide insight into possible structures that support teachers as they navigate and manage the interdependence of personal and professional identities and emotional labour.

This research was important to further understand the role of a teacher as the world evolves around us. As the professional responsibilities of teachers in Alberta change to address societal change, it is important to acknowledge changes in classroom demographics, increased complex needs, and increased support initiatives which contribute to teacher stress and a need for teacher wellness. The outcome of this study was expected to provide insight into structures and processes to support teachers in managing emotional labour.

In March of 2018, an invitation was placed on social media for mid-career teachers to participate in a survey and possible follow up interviews. The survey was open for six days and received one hundred and fifty-five responses. There was only one response to participate in a personal interview. The participant offering to interview was a teacher at a neighbouring school, and due to the reality that I could be viewed as in a power position because I am an assistant principal, the interview was not offered.
Survey data was collected through an online survey and organized on an Excel spreadsheet by question. Data provided by participants with less than six and more than twenty-six years of experience were not included as they were outside the parameters defining mid-career teachers. The data was analyzed to identify frequency of response by question to identify trends between specific demographics and their responses to both closed and open-ended questions.

Open-ended survey responses were coded for emerging themes. Specific to rationale for wanting to leave or remain in the profession, the themes that emerged were a continued passion for the job. This passion was described in terms of meeting the needs of all children, building relationships, and a love of learning. In terms of situations where teachers act differently than they feel to address the perceived expectations of a teacher, teachers spoke of increased work demands, a lack of support from parents, in conflict situations with colleagues, and a perceived lack of respect from students.

Published research on teacher identity and emotional labour was compared to the data collected from participants. The literature review outlined in Chapter 2 of this thesis shares this research. There are correlations, and new trends which have presented.

In conclusion, recommendations have been made to the administrative team of my current school and division. The recommendations address supporting teachers in managing emotional labour through mental health supports and working towards relational trust. Implementing opportunities for self-care and wellness, conversation with the local chapter of the Alberta Teachers’ Association to provide better contractual supports, and opportunities for debriefs and sharing are means to attaining these supports. Also, teacher wellness and mental health can be supported by addressing teacher workloads through improved supports for
EMOTIONAL LABOUR AND TEACHER IDENTITY

inclusive classrooms, and professional learning in the areas of technology, inclusion, collaboration, and wellness. These recommendations are further outlined later in this chapter.

Conclusions

In comparing the results from the survey participants with my personal experiences, I found that emotions do affect teacher practice on a daily basis. Teaching is a profession based in relationships. The current research on social identity theory, and emotional labour, aligns with the findings that daily interactions between students, parents, teachers, and the community evoke a variety of emotions which require emotional labour for regulation.

The conclusions that arise from a comparison of the data provided by participants and the published literature on personal and professional identity and emotional labour, are indicative of the need for further research in this area. First, teachers struggle to differentiate their personal and professional identities as the personal emotions of a teacher do affect the ability of a teacher to accomplish professional responsibilities. Second, the emotional labour required in teaching involves display rules, surface acting, and deep acting, however individual teachers have little knowledge or understanding of these terms. Third, although a high percentage of teachers have considered leaving the profession, the reasons for choosing to stay, and the reason for considering leaving are very closely connected. The fourth conclusion is that teachers should have a voice in identifying the structures that might support in managing the effects of emotional labour.

Personal and Professional Identity

The responses provided through the survey support the data in current research. Teachers do in fact find difficulty in separating personal and professional identities. An interesting finding was that 27% of responses spoke directly to the definitions of professional identity shared within
the survey. When asked to describe their personal identities, the terms pedagogical, didactical, and subject matter expert were used. Participants had difficulty describing their personal identity separately from their professional identity. This might in part have been due to the structure of the survey. A definition was shared to describe professional identity, where no specific definition of personal identity was shared. Many of the descriptors shared can be linked to an ethic of care, supporting the research that states that teachers find their identities at the intersection of personal and public life.

**Emotional Labour**

Emotional Labour can be confused with the emotions that an employee feels when completing the required expectations of an assigned role. Distinguishing between these emotions and the definition of Emotional Labour coined by Hochschild can be valuable in further understanding the distinction between the personal and professional identity of teachers. Although participants strongly shared the reality of emotions in teaching, there does not seem to be an understanding the display rules of a profession or assignment, or of surface acting and deep acting which are embedded in these roles. One participant suggested “Support and recognition that there is emotion labour to start. Then offering ways to create validation and support for those feeling taxes or overwhelmed.” A shared understanding of emotional labour can support teachers in managing their personal and professional emotions. When people are given the time and space to understand why they might be feeling a certain way and how their emotions affect them personally and professionally, they can manage the effects of emotional labour.

**Teacher Retention**

Remaining in the profession of teaching through times of change and challenge, participants shared many of the reasons why they have or have not considered leaving. Reasons
shared by the 26% of participants who have not considered leaving the profession speak to a continued connection with their reasons for choosing teaching initially. The love of a job which encourages the growth of young people by sharing a passion has continued or grown. For those who have considered leaving, the evolution of the role of a teacher has brought an overwhelming frustration with increased responsibilities and change in the dynamics and demographics of the system. Teachers are tired and overwhelmed with increased levels of stress. Although there is still a love for the work, and for the children, there is a need for increased system supports in ensuring that teachers develop resiliency as they continue to provide effective quality instruction.

**Structures to Support Managing Emotional Labour**

Providing supports for teachers in the areas of mental health, relational trust, self-care and wellness are seen as necessary and a priority. Also, continued work with professional organizations to provide contractual supports for personal time within and outside of the school day is seen as need. Within the schools, a focus on culture, time to debrief and share in times of challenge, increased supports for inclusive practices, and time for professional learning to address changing expectations, inclusion, collaboration, and wellness is stated as a necessity.

**Recommendations for Further Research**

I initially pursued the topic of identity and emotional labour after a family member actively chose to leave the profession after 14 years of service. I had noticed that there appeared to be a large amount of mid-career teachers who had become disillusioned and disenfranchised with the profession. At this point in their careers, they were wondering what else they could do and maintain the financial security that goes along with teaching. As I began my research, I became more and more interested in the effects of emotional labour. Teaching is a human
service, and accordingly requires human resources that address the wellness and wellbeing of its members.

Schools and school systems ought to conduct further research regularly to provide information on how their staff would benefit from increased wellness initiatives. Educational contexts are ever-changing. Accordingly, inquiring into what staff value in terms of wellness on an annual basis at the beginning of a school year should be used to frame a wellness plan.

Administrators and teacher leaders should be aware of and assessing the effectiveness of activities and initiatives that support relational trust and school culture. A caution would be to also be aware of the perceived requirements of teachers with such activities. Initiatives offered should still remain optional while clear in the purpose. Providing opportunities for staff voice and input should be included in order to guide future planning.

When implementing new initiatives, it is important to be aware of the already existing required responsibilities. System and school leaders need to be aware of the increased responsibilities and provide outlets for staff feedback while removing responsibilities that no longer serve a purpose. When a purpose is shared with transparency, teachers can value the changes.

Further research to understand the effects of emotional labour will support teachers as they navigate difficult times of change. We are in the business of people, and relationships and emotions are foundational in the good that we do. Doing what is right for kids is the priority, however, doing what is right for teachers should be as well.
References


Appendix A: Survey Questions

Survey Questions

Digital Version: https://goo.gl/8axfwx

Section 1: Preamble and study description, digital consent

1. Are you male or female? Male/female
2. How long have you been a member of the teaching profession? 0-5/6-10/11-15/16-20/21-25/more than 25
3. What role do you currently hold? Classroom teacher/teacher leader/counsellor/school based leader/district level staff
4. In what division is your experience primarily? Early years/middle years/high school/administration

Section 2: Personal and Professional Identity

Researchers have suggested that teachers see their professional identity as having three elements:

- Subject matter expertise
- Didactical expertise
- Pedagogical expertise

For the purpose of this research, these elements can be defined as:

- A subject matter expert is a teacher who bases his/her perception of the profession on subject knowledge and skills;
- A didactical expert is a teacher who bases his/her perception of the profession on knowledge & skills regarding the planning, execution, and evaluation of teaching and learning processes;
- A pedagogical expert is a teacher who bases his/her perception of the profession on knowledge and skills to support students’ social, emotional and moral development.

5. How would you describe your professional identity based on these definitions? Check all that apply. Subject matter expert/didactical expert/pedagogical expert.
6. How would you describe your personal identity using key words?
7. In your opinion, can teachers separate their personal and professional identities?
   Yes/no/other
8. What were the main reasons you chose to become a teacher?
9. Are these reasons still applicable to you currently? Yes/no/sometimes
10. Have you ever considered leaving the profession? Yes/no
11. If no, please identify key reasons?
12. If yes, please identify key reasons?

Section 3: Emotional Labour and Teaching

Emotional labour is a concept that was identified by Arlie Hochschild in 1983 in her book “The Managed Heart.”
For the purpose of this research, emotional labour is defined as the process which occurs when employees introduce or suppress emotions in order to present themselves in a certain way that is expected in the role.

13. Describe a situation where you acted differently than you felt to meet the perceived expectations of a teacher. Long answer.

14. Do you feel emotionally supported in your role? Yes/no

15. Who supports you emotionally? Colleagues/school-based support teams/district level support/friends and family

16. Describe a situation where your personal emotions have affected your professional duties as a teacher. Long answer

17. What processes or structures need to be implemented or changed to better support teachers in managing the effects of emotional labor?

Section 4: Thank you for Participating
Confirmation statement upon submission: Thank you for participating in this research. Your time and considerations are greatly appreciated. Should you like to participate in the interview process for this research please contact me at fiskmviu@gmail.com.
Appendix B: Interview Protocol and Session Questions

Welcome and Reminders

- Welcome participant to the session and thank them for taking the time to attend
- Review consent
- Reassure confidentiality and anonymity between participants and the researcher
- Review withdrawal process
  - Can withdraw at any time without prejudice until 14 days after reviewing and returning personalized transcripts to the researcher.

Sharing and Questions

- Open with a reminder of the purpose and review of the guiding question for project
- Encourage participants to freely share and respond to questions
- Guiding questions

Closing

- Summarizing statements

Session questions

Please describe your professional identity as a teacher.

What things are important to you as a professional?

How might you describe your personal identity?

What are your core values in your personal life?

Please think back to a time when you felt emotionally conflicted between your personal and professional identity. Tell me about it. How did you manage this situation?

Please describe a time in your career when you responded emotionally to a situation, but you were unable to express your true feelings due to professional expectations. How did you manage this situation?

In your experience, what structures or processes are in place to support teachers in managing the effects of emotional situations?

What changes would you suggest in order to better support teachers in managing the effects of emotional labour?
Appendix C: Email Letter of Invitation to Teachers

The following will be sent by email to teachers who opt to participate through professional networks such as Twitter, Facebook, and previous assignments.

[Date]

You are invited to be a part of a study titled:

The Effect of Emotional Labor on Teacher Identity

My name is Marsie Fisk and I am a graduate student at Vancouver Island University. This project is a part of the requirements for my Master of Educational Leadership degree. The objective of my research is to examine the effect of emotional labor on personal and professional identities of teachers by seeking mid-career teachers in Alberta to participate in the study.

You are invited to participate in the online survey portion of my research. The results will be kept anonymous.

Additional details of the study can be found in the detailed information at the beginning of the online survey. The survey is available at https://goo.gl/8axfwx. This information is meant to enable you to make an informed decision about whether or not to participate. Please review it before responding. If you have questions about this project, or would like to participate, contact me at fiskmviu@gmail.com, and I will answer your questions.

Sincerely,

Marsie Fisk

MEDL Student, Vancouver Island University
Appendix D: Consent for Participation in Online Survey

The Effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity

Principal Investigator
Marsie Fisk, Student Researcher
Master of Education
Vancouver Island University
fiskmviu@gmail.com

Student Supervisor
Peter Skipper
Department of Education
Vancouver Island University
peter.skipper@viu.ca

I am a student in the Master of Education in Educational Leadership at Vancouver Island University (VIU). My research, entitled “The Effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity,” aims to identify factors that impact the professional and personal identity of teachers as a result of emotional responses to the requirements of the teaching profession.

I would like to ask if you would be willing to participate in an online survey with emphasis on professional and personal identity and emotional labour. All responses to the online survey will be anonymous. You will not be required to respond to any specific questions; however, consent to participate is required in order to access the survey.

There are no expected risks associated with participating in this research, however as with any online related activity the risk of a breach is always possible. To the best of my ability your answers in this study will remain confidential. I will minimize any risks by ensuring your anonymity and confidentiality within the final report. The information you provide will be summarized in anonymous format in the body of the final report. At no time will any specific comments be attributed to any individual.

I will work to protect your privacy throughout this study. All information I collect will be maintained in confidence with hard copies (e.g., consent forms) stored in a locked filing cabinet in my home. Electronic data (such as transcripts and survey data) will be stored on a password-protected computer located at my home. Information will be recorded in hand-written or audio
format and, where appropriate, will be summarized in anonymous format in the body of the final report. At no time will any specific comments be attributed to any individual unless specific agreement has been obtained beforehand.

All documentation will be kept strictly confidential. All raw data, and consent forms will be destroyed one year after the completion of this project, or by June 30, 2019. No data will be retained on any individual who decides to withdraw.

Google Forms is being used to collect your survey responses. Survey data will be stored on Google servers located in the United States and various different countries and thus is subject to Google data privacy policies and foreign legislation. For information on Google privacy policy, see [URL link to company’s privacy policy].

I will download and delete all survey data from Google servers not more than two weeks after completion of data collection, which I expect will be by May 1, 2018. I will not collect any personally identifiable information, including Internet Protocol (IP) addresses.

Please note that because Google stores data on servers located outside of Canada, data you provide would not be protected by Canadian privacy legislation, may be accessed by foreign government/s in accordance with its/their laws.

The results of this study will be published in my Master’s thesis, and may also be used for conference publications, presentations, and published in peer-reviewed journals.

In addition to submitting my final report to Vancouver Island University in partial fulfillment for a Master of Educational Leadership degree, I will also be sharing my research findings with Parkland School Division and participants as requested. The data will be used to write the final report and may also be used in journal articles and presentations. The final report will be made available to members of Senior Executive and Lead Team. Research participants wishing to obtain a copy will need to request one through from me, if appropriate before December 30, 2018.

You may withdraw from the study at any time, without prejudice. If you are participating in the online survey, do not submit the results and the data will not be stored. Additionally, the anonymous data contributed to the survey cannot be removed after it has been submitted. If you choose to participate in a personal interview, a transcript of our conversation will be shared with you approximately 7 days after the interview. You will then have 7 days to review and edit the
transcript. You will no longer be able to withdraw after 14 days from returning the revised transcript to me as responses will be included in study data.

You are not required to participate in this research project, your participation is completely voluntary. By replying directly to the e-mail request for participation, or signing the in-person consent form at an interview, you indicate that you have read and understood the information above and give your free and informed consent to participate in this project.

I have read and understand the information provided above, and hereby consent to participate in this research under the following conditions:

Digital Consent □ □ Yes No

I, Marsie Fisk, promise to adhere to the procedures described in this consent form.

Principal Investigator Signature __________________________ Date _______________

If you have any concerns about your treatment as a research participant in this study, please contact the VIU Research Ethics Board by telephone at 250-740-6631 or by email at reb@viu.ca.

Participants should be provided a copy of the signed consent form.
Appendix E: Draft Teachers’ Interview Consent Form

The Effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity

Principal Investigator
Marsie Fisk, Student Researcher
Master of Education
Vancouver Island University
fiskmviu@gmail.com

Student Supervisor
Peter Skipper
Department of Education
Vancouver Island University
Peter.Skipper@viu.ca

I am a student in the Master of Education in Educational Leadership at Vancouver Island University (VIU). My research, entitled “The Effects of Emotional Labour on Teacher Identity,” aims to identify factors that impact the professional and personal identity of teachers as a result of emotional responses to the requirements of the teaching profession.

I would like to ask if you would be willing to participate in a personal interview with emphasis on professional and personal identity and emotional labour. The information collected during the interview would be likely be uncontroversial, and thus the research poses only a very small risk of harm to participants. There may however be the potential for emotional stress, as well as social risk of being indirectly identified. There are no other known risks associated with this research.

I will work to protect your privacy throughout this study. With your permission, the interview would be audio recorded and later transcribed into writing. To ensure anonymity to the best of my ability, all transcripts will be vetted for identifying information and will be coded so
there are no identifying statements shared in my final report. You will be provided a copy of the transcript and invited to make changes to the transcript as you wish (e.g. if you would like withdraw a particular statement you made during an interview). All records of your participation would be confidential. Only my supervisor and I will have access to information in which you are identified. Electronic data will be stored on a password-protected computer. Signed consent forms and paper copies of interview transcripts will be stored in a locked file cabinet in my home. Data will be deleted and shredded at the end of the project, approximately June 30, 2019. No data will be retained on any individual who decides to withdraw.

The results of this study will be published in my Master’s thesis, and may also be used for conference publications, presentations, and published in peer-reviewed journals.

In addition to submitting my final report to Vancouver Island University in partial fulfillment for a Master of Educational Leadership degree, I will also be sharing my research findings with Parkland School Division and participants as requested. The data will be used to write the final report and may also be used in journal articles and presentations. The final report will be made available to members of Senior Executive and Lead Team. Research participants wishing to obtain a copy will need to request one through from me, if appropriate before December 30, 2018.

As a personal interview participant, a transcript of our conversation will be shared with you approximately 7 days after the interview. You will then have 14 days to review and edit the transcript. You will no longer be able to withdraw after 14 days from returning the revised transcript to me as responses will be included in study data.
You are not required to participate in this research project, your participation is completely voluntary. By signing the in-person consent form at an interview, you indicate that you have read and understood the information above and give your free and informed consent to participate in this project.

I have read and understand the information provided above, and hereby consent to participate in this research under the following conditions:

- I consent to the interview being audio recorded. [ ] Yes [ ] No
- I consent to having my personal identity disclosed in the products of the research. [ ] Yes [ ] No
- I consent to being quoted in the products of the research. [ ] Yes [ ] No

Participant Name ___________________ Participant Signature ______________________

I, Marsie Fisk, promise to adhere to the procedures described in this consent form.

Principal Investigator Signature __________________________ Date _______________

If you have any concerns about your treatment as a research participant in this study, please contact the VIU Research Ethics Board by telephone at 250-740-6631 or by email at reb@viu.ca.

Participants should be provided a copy of the signed consent form.